

ENCLOSURE 3

PROPOSED TEMPLATE FOR PROVIDING COMMENTS ON THE TEXT

OBSERVATIONS TO DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION FROM IRISH DEVELOPMENT EDUCATION ASSOCIATION (IDEA)

MEMBER STATE: _____

GENERAL COMMENTS ON THE INSTRUMENT:

In framing these observations on the Preliminary on the report on progress made towards the revision of the 1974 Recommendation and revised Draft Recommendation, IDEA consulted widely with our members. The following is a summary of our discussions.

The revision of the 1974 Recommendation is welcome and timely and comes at a time when we are emerging from a global pandemic and are facing other significant global challenges, such as sustainability, climate crisis and biodiversity breakdown, all of which have environmental, social, economic and cultural dimensions.

The Draft Revised Recommendation is a strong, progressive document, bringing together the multitude of concepts and positions relating to education for peace, justice, equality, sustainability. It is also a useful reference document for those operating in global citizenship education, human rights education and education for sustainable development. It rightly emphasises that education should reflect these themes.

We particularly welcome:

- The new and more streamlined structure of the document.
- The participatory approach to education and strong emphasis on all forms of collaboration runs throughout the document which recognises the many and diverse actors and stakeholders involved including:
 - The important of role civil society organisations in the delivery of education programmes.
 - The involvement of Local Authorities in the roll out of this recommendation.
- The definition of sustainable development that underlines the interconnectedness of Earths ecosystems
- The emphasis on Global Citizenship Education
- The focus on gender equality and the commitment to challenging and eliminating harmful stereotypes in all areas.
- The supposition that education should be “transformative”
- The increased emphasis on adult education/lifelong learning throughout the document.
- The focus on youth and non-formal education.
- The sections on Follow-up and Review and Promotion to ensure the implementation of this Recommendation at MS State level.

What could be strengthened/improved upon:

- We note that the terms “democracy/democratic” are largely absent from the document. While the document rightly has a strong focus on human rights, it is disappointing that this is not reinforced with the concept of democracy being front and centre of the Recommendation.
- There is not sufficient reference to nature/the natural environment across the document. While we acknowledge the recognition of the interconnectedness of the world’s ecosystems within the definition of sustainable development, this is not reflected throughout the document which is overly “human centred”.
- The reference to human responsibility that we all have towards the natural world/planet is welcome, but the totality of life and relationships across the natural world need greater emphasis. There is a need to reference how we can repair the relationship between the built and natural environments.
- Sufficient attention has not been placed on Social and Emotional Learning – particularly in view of the significant body of research and learning on its essential role over the past 50 years
- The emphasis on respect for diversity is welcome. At the same time, it would be important to see a more proactive approach to encourage global voices and perspectives to be included in all forms of education
- There is no reference to decolonisation within the revised recommendation, although the term and concept are becoming more widely used and applied in recent years. The only reference to the legacy of colonialism is in the DG Report (section 16(h) p. 21) in relation to the Latin American and Caribbean consultation which “identified a series of threats to human rights and peace affecting education in the region, including **colonial practices permeating the educational curricula**.....”. References in this Recommendation on the need to “decolonise education” would be welcome.
- The important role vocational/technical education plays in building a sustainable and equitable future is not sufficiently addressed throughout the document.

CURRENT TEXT	NEW PROPOSED TEXT OR COMMENTS
PARAGRAPH # TITLE	PARAGRAPH # TITLE
Title REVISED RECOMMENDATION CONCERNING EDUCATION FOR INTERNATIONAL UNDERSTANDING, CO-OPERATION AND PEACE AND EDUCATION RELATING TO HUMAN RIGHTS AND FUNDAMENTAL FREEDOMS ('1974 RECOMMENDATION')SUMMARY Draft Recommendation concerning Education for Global Citizenship, Peace, Human Rights and Sustainable Development	We welcome the revised title and in particular the inclusion of "Education for Global Citizenship" and "Sustainable Development"
PARAGRAPH # 1-6 Aims	PARAGRAPH #1-6 Aims
4. Specifically, education should aim to be transformative, seeking to prepare, motivate and empower learners to take informed decisions and actions Skills and competencies listed from a – k	Paragraph 4: Comment: 4. Particularly welcome the statement that "education should aim to be transformative". Consideration might be given to adding additional competency/skill: Paragraph 4: New text proposed in bold: Character development to enable learners understand their role as active global citizens.
PARAGRAPH #7 Scope	PARAGRAPH #7 – Scope
Existing Wording At all levels, from early childhood.....and adult education	The emphasis in this section on scope is more formal education sector rather than informal/non-formal learning. The scope could be more inclusive and target all adults/young people. Suggested wording: At all levels, from early childhood.....and adult and community education (This would emphasise the inclusion of all adults whether in formal, non-formal or informal education settings).
PARAGRAPH #8 Definitions	PARAGRAPH #8 Definitions
8 (g) Sustainable Development "Sustainable development" is development that meets the needs of the present without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. This vision of development is shaped by an understanding that the Earth's systems are interconnected, and that the economic, social, cultural and environmental features of our world are linked. It promotes a world where human rights are universally respected, and where human beings care for and respect other living beings and the integrity of the planet. Sustainable	Paragraph8 (g) Comment Sustainable Development: ▪ This inclusion of interconnectedness of the Earth's ecosystems in the definition is particularly welcome. However, while references to ecosystems and biodiversity loss are incorporated in the definitions and guiding principles, they don't come through in other sections. The totality of life and relationships across the natural world need greater emphasis.

development also requires fostering a sense of global citizenship , by which all people develop a sense of belonging to a single human family sharing a common destiny on Earth;	Paragraph 8(g): New Text Proposed (bold text): Need to emphasise a rights-based approach to sustainable development – insert “human rights” Sustainable development also requires fostering a sense of global citizenship and human rights, by which all people develop a sense of belonging to a single human family sharing a common destiny on Earth;
PARAGRAPH #9-10 Guiding Principles	PARAGRAPH #9-10 Guiding Principles
Para 9.i. Recognize that, since humans are part of the Earth’s ecosystems, social, economic, cultural and environmental dimensions are closely interrelated, and, therefore, that peace and development should be oriented towards the benefit of all within planetary boundaries;	General Comment on Guiding Principles The link between the natural world and human development makes this one of the most important statements in the Declaration. In many ways, it underpins rationale for the recommendation. Yet this link between natural environment, planet and human development does not run through the entire document.
PARAGRAPHS #11-18 Governance, Accountability and Partnerships	PARAGRAPHS #11-18 Governance, Accountability and Partnerships
12. In line with international human rights obligations and commitments and within their legal systems, Member States should provide financial, administrative and material resources to their maximum availability, including through international assistance and cooperation, and foster the supportive environment necessary to implement this Recommendation and its follow-up and review. 15. Member States should build capacities and sustainable education partnerships with other Member States, international and non-governmental organizations, national independent human rights institutions, community organizations, existing communities of practice and civil society actors in ways that meaningfully advance peace, human rights, sustainable development and citizenship. By doing so, the implementation of this Recommendation can be an exercise in international understanding and cooperation. Member States can, for example, organize or assist appropriate authorities and non-governmental organizations in holding international meetings and other efforts to support the exchange of good practices in and experiences of transformative approaches to education. They should also ensure that the experiences of educational institutions that have carried out successful programmes in transformative education are studied and disseminated	Paragraph 12 - Comment The recommendation that MS must provide financial, administrative and material resources is seminal to the delivery and implementation of the recommendation. Paragraph 15 Comments ▪ This recommendation for international co-operation is particularly welcome. However, there is no reference or proposal as to how this type of co-operation or the development of sustainable education partnerships across international borders might be funded. ▪ The recommendation that MS build partnerships with existing communities of practise and civil society organisations is an important recognition of the work that is being done by the vast range of actors and stakeholders within this sphere

PARAGRAPH #19 – 26 Curriculum & Pedagogies	PARAGRAPH #19 – 26
24. The teaching and learning of history should help to build a critical understanding of the complex relationships between past, present and future and of the legacies of violence and exclusion. This requires maintaining historical accuracy, promoting multi-perspectivity, developing critical thinking about the past and exploring the multiple factors and events that, over time, can either contribute towards violence and tensions, or foster solidarities, between and within countries. The teaching and learning of history should also involve the study of successful peace-building endeavours, experiences of solidarity and peaceful alternatives to violent forms of conflict resolution.	The ‘curriculum and pedagogy’ section within the Recommendation contains several important principles: We welcome ▪ The emphasis on learner centred pedagogies ▪ The inclusion of sport and learning through sport (para 23) ▪ The emphasis on the importance of the teaching and learning of history(para 24). ▪ The emphasis on all learners engaging with STEM to enhance critical thinking and creative capacities We would request that: ▪ A reference to outdoor education/green spaces for learning be included here. ▪ Para 24, (re the teaching and learning of history) includes a reference to “decolonising education” (particularly in view of the issues raised in the Latin American/Caribbean Consultation as referred to in the DG Report [p. 25, section 16.h) .
PARAGRAPH #27- 28 Assessment and Evaluation	PARAGRAPH #27- 28 Assessment and Evaluation
27. Assessment of and for learning should be prioritized in order to strengthen collaboration, cooperation and mutual understanding, identify barriers to learning, enhance learners’ abilities to succeed and develop the reflective capacity of individuals and communities. Educators and Education policy-makers should ensure that assessment and evaluation do not harm learners by, for example, fostering unhealthy competition between students, instilling a sense of failure, labelling learners, or condoning discrimination or social exclusion. Special attention should be paid to assessment and evaluation conditions for learners with disabilities and/or disadvantages, and to the particular requirements of online learning.	27. The emphasis on collaboration, co-operation in assessment is particularly important. The proposal that “Education policy-makers should ensure that assessment and evaluation do not harm learners” is one of the most important and seminal recommendations in the Recommendation. (It might be useful to note that this was an issue that was addressed in our submission to the recent NCCA Consultation on the new Leaving Certificate Climate Action and Sustainable Development subject.)
PARAGRAPHS #29 – 33 Learning and Teaching Resources	PARAGRAPH #29-33 Learning and Teaching Resources
29. To meet the needs expressed in this Recommendation, Member States should ensure learners and teachers have access to teaching and learning materials in different formats prepared in the language or languages of learners and the country. They should ensure these materials are developed as open educational resources under an appropriate open licence to facilitate the sharing of knowledge for the public good.	Para. 29 (comment) How does the commitment to open educational resources for the public good work with textbooks from private companies? Professor Patrick Paul Walsh from UCD/SDG Academy has done extensive work on Open Education Resources (OER)

30. Member States should invest in and facilitate the renewal, production, dissemination and exchange of up-to-date, high-quality devices, materials and resources, which can support transformative approaches to education in all contexts, promote interactive and experiential learning, and account for new digital opportunities and risks based on scientific evidence. Providing these tools will not only enable learners to engage with digital learning, but also help learners to acquire the knowledge and skills and develop the values they need to actively engage in the world from a variety of sources outside of formal schooling, such as, for example, the digital sphere, magazines, books, libraries, museums, social clubs and associations Paragraph 32 32. All materials and resources should be adapted to learners' educational level, developmental needs and local context. They should be gender-transformative and free from harmful stereotypes, discriminatory and hateful bias, and elements that incite intolerance, hostility, discrimination or violence towards any individuals, groups or peoples. Materials and resources should also actively aim to challenge and eradicate underlying prejudices and deep-rooted stereotypes and contribute to overcoming their consequences, including eventual traumas.	Para. 30 New Text Proposed in Bold: 30. Member States should invest in and facilitate the renewal, production, dissemination and exchange of up-to-date, high-quality devices, materials and resources, which can support transformative approaches to education in all contexts, promote interactive and experiential learning, and account for new digital opportunities and risks based on scientific evidence. Providing these tools will not only enable learners to engage with digital learning, but will also promote critical media literacy as learners develop skills to detect bias and fake news/ misinformation and will help learners to acquire the knowledge and skills and develop the values they need to actively engage in the world from a variety of sources outside of formal schooling, such as, for example, the digital sphere, magazines, books, libraries, museums, social clubs and associations Note: The added text (in bold) refers back to Art 4(j) Paragraph 32 Comment: We particularly welcome the recommendation for the production of gender transformative learning materials and resources and elimination of all forms of deep-rooted and harmful stereotyping from such materials resources - not simply avoiding stereotypes but challenging them.
PARAGRAPH 34 – 36 Learning Environments 35. Member States should support access to life-wide and lifelong learning in a diversity of learning spaces and environments (including public spaces, workplaces, community institutions, scientific and cultural institutions and local contexts such as parks and streets, etc.) in order to expand access to and enrich the experience of transformative education..... Local authorities and other social institutions should be actively involved in this effort to extend opportunities for meaningful learning. 36(a) Supporting educators and system-wide efforts to ensure schools and other education and learning environments and their facilities are accessible, enabling and safe. Learning spaces must be made and kept free from incitement to hatred, discrimination and violence, and harassment motivated by racism, all forms of discrimination,	PARAGRAPH 34 – 36 Learning Environments Para. 35 New Text Proposed in Bold: 35. and local contexts such as parks, community gardens, waterways and streets, etc Para 35 Comment Welcome reference to role of local authorities. Local Authorities will need to be briefed on this Recommendation and encouraged as to how to participate. In Ireland, this might be incorporated into plans for local authorities under the SDG NIP. 36(a) This section would benefit from a greater emphasis on ensuring that learning/spaces environments are fully accessible to learners with disabilities.

xenophobia or related intolerance, or cultural bias. Environments should be culture-, gender- and disability-sensitive and inclusive, and should embrace anti-discrimination and anti-racist practices, while promoting peace, tolerance, inclusivity, empathy, solidarity and care for the environment;	Moreover, not only education spaces should be accessible for learners with disabilities but so too should the programme structure e.g. part-time options.
PARAGRAPH 37 – 38 Educator Development	PARAGRAPH 37 – 38 Educator Development
	Pars 37 – 38 General Comments: We would suggest that the section on Educator Development should include reference to: ▪ the importance of supporting the continuing professional development of educators; ▪ The need for wraparound supports for educators to safeguard their own psychological and emotional needs ▪ Supports for educators working with learners who have had to flee from war/violence, displaced learners including refugees, asylum seekers and victims of trafficking.
PARAGRAPH 42 – 44 School Education	PARAGRAPH 42 – 44 School Education
42. Inclusive, equitable, quality and relevant primary and secondary education are central to addressing contemporary challenges and achieving the aims of this Recommendation. This means that learner retention needs as much attention as access in order to ensure that all learners leave school with the competencies required to lead active and productive lives as adults. 43. To guarantee education as a human right for all, Member States should make clear commitments and provide infrastructural and other forms of professional and technical support (e.g. textbooks, transport, good quality teaching and adequate facilities) to help learners in schools achieve learning outcomes and ensure continuity of learning in case of need, as well as bridging opportunities in circumstances of adversity so that learners are not left behind or excluded.	School education – General Comments: This section needs some further expansion in relation to teacher support and development. Suggest including references to ▪ Providing social training and looking after teachers' psychological and emotional needs ▪ Social and political education for teachers ▪ Specific reference to resourcing special needs pupils/classes Para 42 Comment Unlike para 39 on early childhood care and education, this article doesn't mention children's well-being or any benefits of education before their lives as adults. Welcome reference to learner retention but also quality of education and a relevant and quality curriculum is needed. It is not clear what is meant by “relevant primary and secondary education”. Para 43: New Text proposed (in bold): 43. To guarantee education as a human right for all, Member States should make clear commitments and provide infrastructural and other forms of professional and technical support (e.g. textbooks, transport, good quality teaching and adequate facilities, adequate staffing, staff training and support) to help learners in schools achieve learning outcomes and ensure continuity of learning particularly in case of need, as well as bridging opportunities in circumstances of adversity so that learners are not left behind or excluded.

44. Inclusive, participatory, transformative, intercultural, research-based and age-appropriate learning approaches are needed Within these approaches, learner-centred pedagogies should be leveraged to integrate the cognitive, social and emotional and action-orientated components of transformative learning.	Para 43 Comment 'bridging opportunities in circumstances of adversity' Is this proactive enough? Language could be stronger re prevention and intervention. Is continuity of learning only for cases of need? Suggestion to use 'particularly in case of need'? (see above new wording) Para 44 Comment: References to Learning Centred Pedagogies to effect transformative education are particularly welcome. Could a point be made here or elsewhere on the importance of collective action?
PARAGRAPH 52 Technical and Vocational Education	PARAGRAPH 52 Technical and Vocational Education
	Para 52: General Comments The section on Vocational Education is disappointing. There is just one paragraph devoted to it (as opposed to seven for higher education, and three each for early childhood, school education and non-formal, informal and adult education . We suggest that this section of the Recommendation should develop the concept of green values for green skills within the vocational sector (e.g. hairdressers procuring chemicals, builders/fitters using ethical materials and understanding supply chains). It may be useful to draw on some of the strong EU Recommendations/ Conclusions on green skills for the green economy. While it is welcome that this Recommendation does not focus on education and skills for economic development (unlike many EU documents), it could be specifically relevant here. The Solas Document Green Skills for FET would be a useful reference point to strengthen this section. .
PARAGRAPH 53 – 55 Non-formal and informal education and adult learning	PARAGRAPH 53- 55 Non-formal and informal education and adult learning
	Paras 53- 55 General Comments It would be preferable to see strong separate sections for non-formal, informal, and adult learning with equal attention to each. As mentioned above, the scope of the Recommendation is heavily focused on formal education. Recognising the space for non-formal education from the start is important. There is no mention of community-education or its impact. We suggest that Community Education be included in section title of paras 52- 55 (Adult and Community Learning).

	Paragraph 53 Comment Adult education - highlights population-level benefits but overlooks the value of individual-level benefits and the often marginalised groups who engage in AE. Paragraph 55- Comment Mentioning Global Youth Work (GYW) is imperative when speaking about non-formal education.
PARAGRAPH 56 – 61 Follow up and Review	PARAGRAPH 56 – 61 Follow up and Review
	General Comments: ▪ The Follow-up and Review Section is central to the implementation of the Recommendation. ▪ We welcome the recommendation that follow up and review processes should be participatory. ▪ It is unclear to what extent UNESCO will follow up and mechanisms will be in place to support follow-up to this Recommendation. ▪ Member States need to ensure sufficient staff to monitor and report back on its implementation. ▪ Civil Society and other related actors should be included in follow up and review, ensuring multi-stakeholder support for the Recommendation.
Para 62 – 64 Promotion	Para 62 – 64 Promotion
	General Comments: ▪ The addition of a new section on promotion of the Recommendation is particularly important for its eventual implementation. ▪ The Recommendation is clear that both UNESCO and Member States have a shared responsibility for the promotion of the Recommendation from local to global levels. ▪ In order for this recommendation to take root, there must be a whole of Government approach in all Member States. ▪ Creating awareness of and support for the Recommendation in Member States will require training of officials across Government Departments and State Organisations ▪ Local Authorities should be aware of the Recommendation and of the important role they can play in its implementation. ▪ Member States must work with all stakeholders at all levels and all forms of education to create awareness of and support for this Recommendation.
Appendices	Appendices
	Suggested Additional Documents to be included in Appendices UNESCO Declaration on the Responsibilities of the Present Generations Towards Future Generations (2022)

Other UN Instruments

[UN Youth Strategy](#) 2018

[UN Youth Policies and Programmes Resolution](#)
(2021)

[Our Common Agenda](#) (2020)

Other Intergovernmental initiatives

[The European Declaration on Global Education to
2050 – The Dublin Declaration](#) (2022)

NOTE TO DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION REGARDING IMPLEMENTATION OF THE RECOMMENDATION IN IRELAND

As outlined above we believe this to be a very progressive and welcome document and look forward to working with the Department for its full implementation in Ireland.

We would request that the Department also take the following into account when seeking to implement the Recommendation:

- The active involvement of the GCE/DE sector in Ireland. There is huge expertise in implementing the principles of the 1974 Recommendation in the GCE/DE sector, which has been carrying out this work for decades and has world-renowned expertise and experience. In that regard, investment in scaling up GCE practice in Ireland would contribute enormously to the implementation of the Recommendation.
- The Recommendation should feed into the work of National Advisory Committee on ESD
- All levels of education to encourage curricular approaches that are multidisciplinary, interdisciplinary and transdisciplinary in ongoing curriculum reform. While this is challenging to achieve, efforts to address this should be rewarded and shared.
- Engagement and linkages between the Recommendation and the primary curriculum review process are essential to embed the Recommendation in school practice.
- Staff within relevant sections of the Department of Education (and other departments engaging in education e.g. Department of Children and Youth Affairs, Department of Foreign Affairs (Irish Aid), Department of Further and Higher Education, Innovation and Science, Department of Climate Action and the Environment) should have a working knowledge of this document.
- Training and support of educators will be central to implement this recommendation.
- Class sizes will impact on the effective implementation in the school education sector.
- There must be realistic expectations of educators within current challenges e.g. staffing, pupil needs.
- There will be a need for investment in dedicated staff (or staff time) to manage the monitoring/follow up as outlined in Section 6.
- SEC and Inspectorate: Take note of the recommendations in relation to Assessment and Evaluation.
- In order to implement the Recommendation fully, the document should allow for implementation based on what is currently happening in Ireland (and internationally) now. Hence the importance of including initiatives that are happening globally are well represented in the resolution e.g., ensuring that Global Youth Work is represented in non-formal section. Note, Global Youth Work and the Youth2030 Programme is a coalition supported by Irish Aid.