Annex I

Assessment of National Recovery and Resilience Plans of seven South European EU Member states and Comparison with their SDG Scores according to the Europe Sustainable Development Report 2021

Note: The results for Italy and Spain shown in this Annex are based on the detailed analysis conducted by Eugenio Carli (University of Siena) and Maríà Cortés Puch (SDSN) respectively, which is included in SDSN’s Europe Sustainable Development Report 2021.
1. Bulgaria

General information and assumptions

- The RRP consists of 12 Components around 48 Investments for a total budget of about 7.17 billion €.
- The Components have been aligned to: Education & Skills, Research and innovation, Smart industry, Low-carbon economy, Biodiversity, Sustainable Agriculture, Digital connectivity, Transport connectivity, Local Development, Business environment, Social Inclusion, Health. The Components are incorporated within the 4 Axes (Innovation, Green Economy, Connectivity- Digitalization, Growth - Social Cohesion).
- A degree of connection between the RRP’s measures and SDGs was established (implicit/explicit connection), so each linkage identified, is considered to have a certain weight.
- It may be the case that the same RRP’s measure is linked to more than one SDG.

Key findings

Overall results

- The majority of the RRP’s measures contributes to the achievement of SDG 7 and 9. SDG 9 is contributed by 3.86 billion and SDG 7 by 3.49 billion.
- SDG’s 3, 4, 10 and 11 are contributed by a intermediate spectrum of budgetary pool, rated from 1,00 to 1,36 billion.
- Over the 10% of the budget (as a threshold) are SDGs No 2 and 12.
- Below the 10% of the budget (as a threshold) are SDGs No 1, 6, 8, 13, 14, 15, 16, 27

Comments

- SDG’s 4, 6, 8, 9 perform the major percentage in terms of measures and investments. It makes sense since ESDR the Dashboard assessment is relevant to Significant (SDG 7) and Major (SDG 9) challenges (ESDR performance respectively 48 and 26 %).
- SDG 4 remarkable percentage in budgetary pool can anticipate the Major Challenges, as presented by ESDR 202. However, although SDG 12 presents the same Major Challenges category in Dashboard, however the percentage in measures and budgetary pool is low (6-11 %)
- All SDG’s that are contributed by the extremely low percentages in budgetary pool of RRP, are also performing Significant Challenges within the ESDR 2021 Dashboard.
2. Croatia

General information and assumptions

- The RRP consists of 6 Components around 22 Investments for a total budget of about 6.4 billion €
- The Components have been aligned to: Economy, Public administration, judiciary and state assets, Education, science and research, Labour market and social protection, Health and Renovation of buildings.
- A degree of connection between the RRP’s measures and SDGs was established (implicit/explicit connection), so each linkage identified, is considered to have a certain weight
- It may be the case that the same RRP’s measure is linked to more than one SDG

Key findings

Overall results

- The majority of the RRP’s measures contributes to the achievement of SDG 8, 9, 10, 13 (between 2.5 and 3.5 billion)
- Over the 15% of the budget (as a threshold) are SDGs No 3, 4, 7, 11, 12, 15.
- Below the 2% of the budget (as a threshold) are SDGs No 2, 14, 5

Comments

- SDG’s 7, 8, 9, 10 perform the major percentage in terms of measures and investments while in ESDR the Dashboard assessment is relevant to minor or significant challenges (ESDR performance respectively 73, 68, 48 and 90 %).
- SDG 13 is performing Major challenges in ESDR 2021 and this exhibits the percentage in terms of measures and budgetary pools (23 / 40%)
- SDG’s 16 and 17 perform a remarkable percentage in measures and budgetary pool, that is unusual in other RRP’s. These Goals perform significant challenges in ESDR (75 and 47 % Dashboard Performance)
- SDG’s No 2 and 5 present the lower percentage in measures and budget within RRP although the ESDR Dashboard assessment indicates Significant challenges remain (performances equal to 62 and 55 % respectively).
3. Cyprus

General information and assumptions
- The RRP consists of **13 Components** for a total budget of about **1,24 billion € Grants**.
- The RRP consists of **120 investments and 7 reforms (Totally 127 measures)**
- A **degree of connection** between the RRP’s measures and SDGs was established (implicit/explicit connection), so each linkage identified, is considered to have a certain weight
- It may be the case that the same RRP’s measure is linked to **more than one SDG**

Key findings

Overall results
- The majority of the RRP’s measures contributes to the achievement of **SDG 9 “Industry, Innovation & Infrastructure”**, both in terms of number of measures addressing (53) and to the achievement of **SDG 13 (Climate Actions in terms of budget allocated (about 451 million €)**
- Then second mostly addressed SDG in terms of budget allocation (35) are **SDG 11, SDG 7 and SDG 8**.
- Over the **10% of the budget (as a threshold)** are SDGs No 3,4, 10, 12, 15
- Below the **5% of the budget (as a threshold)** are SDGs No 14,17

Comments
- According to ESDR 2021, ‘major challenges remain’ for Cyprus in SDGs 2, 6, 9, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 17
- Out of these, performance has deteriorated in SDG 2 and has been stagnant in SDGs 6, 11, 12, 13.
- Therefore there is a major gap in SDG 2 – few measures are foreseen, and a small budget is allocated to related policies in the national RRP.
- More specifically, the RRP does not adequately address issues in which Cyprus performs below average in SDG 2:
  - Prevalence of obesity
  - Human trophic level (e.g. meat in the diet of the population)
  - Nitrogen balance on agricultural land
  - Ammonia emissions in agriculture
- This leads to the conclusion that the national budget and financial support from other EU funds from the regular EU budget of 2021-27 should prioritise policies addressing SDG 2.
• Moreover, attention should be given to areas that are ‘hidden’ under better-performing SDGs, such as:
  – Biodiversity and groundwater pollution, which are part of SDG 15
  – Green space in urban areas, which is included in SDG 11.
4. Greece

General information and assumptions

- The RRP consists of 18 Components for a total budget of about 18.4 billion € Grants, of which almost 12.7 billion € Loans. The Potential mobilised resources are estimated at the level of 59.8 billion € (mobilised by Loans and Grants totally).
- The Components have been aligned with the 7 flagship areas of Commission: Power Up, Renovation, Refuel - Recharge, Connect, Scale Up are linked to 1 Component. Modernise is linked to 9 Components and Reskill - Upskill to 7 components. Each flagship area can be linked to more than 1 Component.
- The RRP consists of 106 investments and 68 reforms (Totally 174 measures)
- A degree of connection between the RRP’s measures and SDGs was established (implicit/explicit connection), so each linkage identified, is considered to have a certain weight
- It may be the case that the same RRP’s measure is linked to more than one SDG

Key findings

Overall results

- The majority of the Greek RRP’s measures contributes to the achievement of SDG 9 “Industry, Innovation & Infrastructure”, both in terms of number of measures addressing (162) and of budget allocated (about 17.77 billion €)
- The second mostly addressed SDG in terms of measures (35) is SDG 8 on “Decent Work & Economic Growth”, both in terms of number of measures addressing (120) and of budget allocated (about 13 billion €)
- In third place in terms of devoted measures is SDG 10 on Reduced Inequalities, both in terms of number of measures (84) and of budget allocated (about 12 billion €).
- SDG 16 (“Peace Justice & Strong Institutions”) is following with 77 measures and 6.17 billion € and then SDG 3 is linked to 59 and 8.73 billion €.
- The least addressed SDGs in the Greek RRP are SDG 17 (“Partnerships for the goals”) with 3 measures and 0.3 billion €, SDG 1 (“No Poverty”) with 14 measures and 3.43 billion € and SDG 2 (“Zero Hunger”) with 16 measures and 3.24 billion €.
- Over the 15% of the budget (as a threshold) are SDGs No 4, 11, 12, 13, 15
- Below the 2% of the budget (as a threshold) are SDGs No 6, 7, 14, 5

Comments

- SDG 9 “Industry, Innovation & Infrastructure” is the most relevant SDGs for the majority of the NRRP’s Measures. Digitization covering industry, enterprises, Institutions, Public Services, Legal System, Tourism, Industry Mobility, Public Health and Research field, research itself and infrastructure are linked to this group of measures. Since the Overall Performance of Greece in SDG 9 , based on ESDR Dashboard assessment is low (48%) with Significant Challenges remain, the percentage in measures and budgetary pool is extremely higher (+ 45 and + 48 percentage units respectively)
- SDG 8 is performing almost the same level of Performance in ESDR 2021 (52%) but with Major Challenges remain, therefore the percentage in terms of measures and budgetary pools exceeds this performance in plus 17-18 percentage units.
- On the contrary SDG 10, that is performing a better overall score in ESDR 2021 (85%) but with Challenges Remain, presents a lower score in percentage of measures (48%) and budget (65%), but this is still the 3rd higher Score among all SDG’s.
- Since there are Significant challenges remain in SDG 16 (70% ESDR Performance) but with moderately improving indicators, this Goal is linked with the 4th higher score in
percentage of measure (44%). But other Goals with lower percentage in measures, exceed SDG 16 in % of budget (33%), for instance SDG 11 (50%), 13 (47%), 3 (33%).

- Although SDGs 1 and 17 are performing significant challenges remain, they perform low percentages in measures and budgetary pool. Regarding SDG 1, there are measures that are targeting in an implicit way in order to relief Poverty, by means of SDG 8 or 10 or 7, within the scope of decent work and growth or reduced inequalities or anticipating energy poverty, or even by means of Institution improving (SDG 16), or by income improvement due to lees taxation achieved by more effective Public Services Frame (to be achieved within a parallel Legislative Framework aside RRP. Foreign affairs and geopolitical – global dimensions of SDG 17 are not directly affected by RRP.
5. Italy

General information and assumptions

- The RRP consists of 6 Missions and 16 Components for a total budget of about 191.5 billion, of which almost 69 billion are in the form of non-repayable support and some 122.5 billion in the form of loan.
- The Missions are: Digitalization, innovation, competitiveness, culture and tourism; Green revolution and ecological transition; Infrastructures for sustainable mobility; Education and research; Cohesion and inclusion; Health.
- The RRP consists of 132 investments and 50 reforms (excluding horizontal and enabling reforms).
- No degree of connection between the RRP’s measures and SDGs was established (eg direct/indirect connection), so all the linkages identified are considered to have the same weight.
- It may be the case that the same RRP’s measure is linked to more than one SDG.

Key findings

Overall results

- The majority of the Italian RRP’s measures contributes to the achievement of SDG 9 on “Industry, innovation and infrastructure”, both in terms of number of measures addressing it (45) and of budget allocated (about 68 billion).
- The second mostly addressed SDG in terms of measures (35) is SDG 11 on “Sustainable cities and communities”, while SDG 13 (“Climate action”) is in second place as to budget allocated (about 41 billion).
- In third place in terms of devoted measures is SDG 13 on “Climate action” (31), while SDG 11 occupies the third position as to budget allocated (approx. 33 billion), immediately followed by SDG 7 on “Affordable and clean energy” (approx. 31 billion).
- The least addressed SDGs in the Italian RRP are SDGs 1 (“No poverty”) and 15 (“Life on land”) with 4 measures each, followed by SDGs 14 (“Life below water”) and 17 (“Partnerships for the goals”) with only 1 measure each.
- Over the 10-billion threshold are SDGs 3, 4, 5, 7, 8, 9, 11 and 13.
- Below the 5-billion threshold are SDGs 1, 2, 10, 12, 14, 15, 16 and 17. SDG 6 is just above the 5-billion threshold (5.24).

Comments

- SDG 9 “Industry, innovation and infrastructure” is one of the most relevant SDGs for the majority of the NRRP’s Missions, thanks to investments ranging from digitization, clean transport, innovative schools and hospitals and scientific research.
- SDG 9, 13, 11, 7, 8, 4 perform the higher score in budget allocation percentage. The result is almost the same with regards to percentage of measures. The point is that only SDG 8 and SDG 7 are performing low scores in ESDR 2021 Dashboard Assessment (54% - 56%). All others present much higher scores (73% - 68%), although the Italian Dashboard presents none SDG Achievement.
- The scarce attention devoted to SDGs 1 and 17 can be explained by two different reasons: first, the poverty rate in Italy is relatively low if compared to developing countries to which SDG 1 is primarily addressed and therefore it is not considered a primary issue. Second, the RRP includes measures addressing mainly national issues.
and therefore the external and global dimensions of SDG 17 are not (directly) impacted by it

- The few measures and very low budget devoted to SDGs 14 and 15 are questionable. In particular, considering the decreasing trend of SDG 15 and stagnating trend for SDG 14, together with major challenges proper to both SDGs - as shown in the ESDR 2021 - the scarcity of relative measures is even more significant. However, it should be noted that environmental sustainability in the Italian RRP is addressed more through a focus on energy transition and abatement of climate-altering emissions, rather than through protection of ecosystems and biodiversity

- The low budget allocated to SDG 2 “Zero hunger” (5 measures, less than 5 billion allocated), with particular regard to the absence of measures on food education and habits and also considering the centrality of the agro-food system in Italy and its central role for achieving sustainability at the global level, should be viewed in negative terms

- Climate action seems adequately dealt with, considering the obligation for Member States to allocate at least 37% of the RRP resources to this topic. However, not all the measures directly contribute to the achievement of the Goal nor are they reflected in SDG 13 specific targets

- The measures on energy efficiency, renewable energy improving and green mobility may contribute to better performances of indicator no. 1 of SDG 13 on greenhouse gas emission per capita

- The focus on climate action and greening transition may hopefully contribute to overcome some Major challenges and increase the performance of Italy with regard to SDG 13

- The resources allocated to clean energy may contribute to the achievement of SDG 7, which was moderately improving according to ESDR 2020

- The measures aimed at implementing proximity networks, facilities and telemedicine for territorial healthcare assistance may contribute to overcome the challenges related to the achievement of SDG 3.
6. Slovenia

General information and assumptions
- The RRP consists of 4 Components around 16 Investments for a total budget of about 2,48 billion €
- The Components have been aligned to: Green Transition, Digital Transformation, Smart, sustainable, and inclusive growth, Health and welfare.
- A degree of connection between the RRP’s measures and SDGs was established (implicit/explicit connection), so each linkage identified, is considered to have a certain weight.
- It may be the case that the same RRP’s measure is linked to more than one SDG.

Key findings

Overall results
- The majority of the RRP’s measures contributes to the achievement of SDG 9, 8, 4, 6 (between 850 and 733 million)
- Over the 15% of the budget (as a threshold) are SDGs No 2, 7, 10, 11, 12, 13, 15.
- Below the 15% of the budget (as a threshold) are SDGs No 1, 3, 5, 14, 17

Comments
- SDG’s 4, 6, 8, 9 perform the major percentage in terms of measures and investments although ESDR the Dashboard assessment is relevant to minor challenges (ESDR performance respectively 76, 78, 77 and 63%).
- SDG’s 12, 13 are performing Major challenges in ESDR 2021 and this exhibits a reasonable percentage in terms of budgetary pools (21 / 28%).
- SDG’s 1 and 10 perform already Achieved targets, therefore SDG 1 presents a relatively low percentage in budgetary pool (10%). However, SDG 10 presents a remarkable budgetary percentage (26%).
- SDG’s No 3, 5, 14 and 17 present extremely low or no percentage in measures and budget within RRP. Within the ESDR Dashboard assessment SDG’s No 5 and 17 indicate Significant challenges remain (performances equal to 60 and 72 % respectively). SDG No 14 performs Major Challenges with Dashboard and the percentage in RRP measures and budgetary pool is extremely low (6 and 5 % respectively).
7. Spain

General information and assumptions

- The RRP consists of **30 Components** around **396 Measures** for a total budget of about **69.5 billion €**.
- **No degree of connection** between the RRP’s measures and SDGs was established (eg direct/indirect connection), so all the linkages identified are considered to have the same weight.
- It may be the case that the same RRP’s measure is linked to **more than one SDG**.

Key findings

Overall results

- The majority of the RRP’s measures contributes to the achievement of **SDG 7, 8, 9, 13**. **SDG 9** is contributed by the majority of measures and budgets. SDG No 9 is first with 42.1 billion, SDG No 13 with 24.8 billion and then SDG’s 7 & 8 with 21 billion.
- SDG’s 3, 4, 10 and 11 are contributed by a intermediate spectrum of budgetary pool, rated from 1.00 to 1.36 billion.
- Between 5 and 20 billion budgetary levels SDG’s No 4, 10,11, 12 are contributed.
- Between 1 and 3.3 billion budgetary levels SDG’s No 3, 5, 6, 14, 15, 16 are contributed.
- Below the **1 billion (as a threshold)** are SDGs No 1, 2, 17.

Comments

- SDG’s 8 & 13 budgetary pool address the major Challenges presented by the ESDR 2021 Dashboard.
- Actually SDG 8 has one red indicator within the ESDR Dashboard: Youth not in employment, education or training (NEET). At least 7 different measures to address this target, including 4 reforms within Component 23: **New public policies for a dynamic, resilient and inclusive labor**. This component is a key objective of the RRP for the aspired reductions in youth unemployment and temporary employment proposing an investment of €765 million by means a series of programs.
- SDG’s 7 & 9 budgetary pool address the Significant Challenges remain, as performed by the ESDR 2021 Dashboard. Especially for SDG 9, most of the indicators for this goal are in green. But 2 indicators are with challenges remain, (i.e. expenditure in R&D). indicator is addressed in 19 measures in the Spanish RRP, especially throughout Component 17: **Science, technology and innovation**.

- SDG No 2, 14, 15 although presented with Major Challenges within the ESDR Dashboard, are not addressed by the corresponded funded pool, that is lower than 5 %. Especially for SDG 2: Only 6% of measures in the Spanish plan and less than 1% of its budget is allocated to SDG 2. Component 3 addresses sustainable food systems with an estimated budget of €1,051 million. This component is very thorough since it aims to improve the quality of the final products, by the creation of modernized animal and plant health laboratories. Farming, within the scope of Circular Economy development should promote sustainable agriculture, seasonal consumption, and reduction of food waste. Food habits and nutrition are contributing to the major challenges of SDG 2 within the Dashboard. RRP does not address this area.
- SDG No 1 and 16 although presented with Significant Challenges remain within the ESDR Dashboard, are not addressed by the corresponded funded pool, that is lower than 5 %.
Spain SDG Performance vs Relevance of NRRP for each SDG

Goal 17 - Partnerships for the Goals
Goal 16 - Peace, Justice & Strong Institutions
Goal 15 - Life on Land
Goal 14 - Life Below Water
Goal 13 - Climate Action
Goal 12 - Responsible Consumption & Production
Goal 11 - Sustainable Cities & Communities
Goal 10 - Reduced Inequalities
Goal 9 - Industry, Innovation & Infrastructure
Goal 8 - Decent Work & Economic Growth
Goal 7 - Affordable & Clean Energy
Goal 6 - Clean Water & Sanitation
Goal 5 - Gender Equality
Goal 4 - Quality Education
Goal 3 - Good Health & Well Being
Goal 2 - Zero Hunger
Goal 1 - No Poverty

% of cost pool
(€69,5 billions - Sum of Grants)
% of total reforms & investments
(396 items)
SDG Performance %
Comparisons among 7 Countries

[Note: The graphs on the following pages are indicative only. The width of each flow in each graph does not necessarily imply a larger emphasis of a specific country on specific targets or goals. Each country’s RRP, as explained in the previous pages, has been organized in different ways – in fewer or more individual policies, measures, or clusters of policies/measures/reforms].
Comparison among 7 National RRP’s. Percentages % in measures for Energy, Innovation and Circularity Group of SDG’s
Comparison among 7 National RRP’s. Percentages % in budgetar pool for Energy, Innovation and Circularity Group of SDG’s
Comparison among 7 National RRP’s. Percentages % in measures for Health, Food and Environment Group of SDG’s
Comparison among 7 National RRP’s. Percentages % in budgetary pool for Health, Food and Environment Group of SDG’s
Comparison among 7 National RRP’s. Percentages % in measures for Social Cohesion Group of SDG’s.
Comparison among 7 National RRP’s. Percentages % in measures for Social Cohesion Group of SDG’s
Aggregate Analysis for all 7 Countries

Relevance of NRRP measures and budget by SDG for 7 South European countries (Bulgaria, Croatia, Cyprus, Greece, Italy, Slovenia, Spain)

Sum of Measures 7 Countries